

*Britain's First Medical Marriage: Frances Morgan,
George Hoggan and the mysterious 'Elsie' **

by Neil McIntyre, MD, FRCP

On 14 March 1970 a large congregation gathered in Brecon Cathedral to celebrate the centenary of Frances Morgan's graduation as a doctor of medicine (MD) of the University of Zurich. To mark the event the cathedral received a brass font ewer inscribed 'One Lord, One Faith, One Baptism. Presented by Brecknock Society and Friends in memory of Frances Elizabeth Hoggan, March 1970'.

Why was Frances Hoggan, *née* Morgan, honoured in this way? Members of the Cymmrodorion in the late nineteenth century would have understood the reasons. Frances was a leading advocate for improving the education of Welsh women and girls, one of only four women to give evidence before the Aberdare Committee on Intermediate and Higher Education in Wales in 1880.¹ She wrote numerous papers and letters to the press on the topic.² She spoke to the Cymmrodorion Section at the National Eisteddfodau in Denbigh in 1882 (on *The Co-education of Women*) and at Cardiff in 1883 (on *The Past and Future of the Education of Girls*); and on 16 November 1883, at the Freemasons' Tavern, she became the first woman to dine with the Cymmrodorion, appealing to her fellow diners for a scholarship fund for women at University College, Cardiff.³

* An expanded version of a lecture delivered to the Society in the British Academy, London, on 16 March 2006. An earlier version of this paper can be found in the *Journal of Medical Biography* 2004; 12:105-114.

1 W. Gareth Evans. *Education and Female Emancipation. The Welsh Experience, 1847-1914*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1990.

2 Frances Hoggan reviewed her contributions in *Education for Girls in Wales* (London: Women's Printing Society, 1882), a pamphlet that featured a transcript of her evidence to the Aberdare Committee and copies of several long letters to the *South Wales Daily News*. See also W. G. Evans, *Education and Female Emancipation*.

3 *Baner ac Amserau Cymru*. 21 November 1883

The memorial service was held in Brecon because Frances was born at 'High Street St Mary's, Brecknock' on 20 December 1843. The current address of the house is 19 High Street, Brecon.

Frances's father, Richard Morgan, was from Crunwear in Pembrokeshire. He studied at Jesus College, Oxford (BA 1831) and when Frances was born he was a curate in Brecon. On 26 January 1843 he married Georgiana Vaughan, a young widow with one son. Her first husband, Louis Richard Vaughan, whom she married on 6 October 1840,⁴ was a young solicitor. He died within weeks of their wedding; their son, also Louis Richard, was born on 19 July 1841.⁵ Georgiana was born in Abergwili, the daughter of Captain John George Philipps RN (1783-1869) of Cwmgwili in Carmarthenshire. He served in the French Revolutionary and Napoleonic wars, was Mayor of Carmarthen in 1816 and contested Carmarthen as a champion of parliamentary reform in 1831. His father, also John George, was Whig MP for Carmarthen from 1784 to 1803, its Mayor in 1783 and 1810, and High Sheriff of Carmarthenshire in 1812. The Philipps of Cwmgwili traced their descent from Cadifor Fawr, Prince of Dyfed, who died in 1089.⁶ Frances's paternal great-grandfather, Thomas Morgan, was a sea captain with the East India Company.

Richard Morgan became vicar of Aberavon with Baglan in 1845. He died there on 9 March 1851, aged 42, of typhoid fever and pneumonia.⁷ On census day (three weeks later) Georgiana still lived at Parsonage House, the vicarage in Baglan, with Louis Vaughan, Emma (4 years), Thomas Herbert (2 years), and Catherine (5 months); Frances and Robert, the two eldest children were absent that day.

Emma married Thomas Jones, later vicar of Heyope near Knighton, where Georgiana died in 1897.⁸ Robert died while duck-hunting in the United States in 1897. Catherine married a younger cousin, Herbert Vaughan Philipps, and moved to Surrey.⁹ Thomas Herbert moved to the United States, initially to Chicago where his daughter, Georgiana Philipps Morgan (1878-1957) was born in 1878. As a girl she spent a short time at the Archdeacon's School for Girls in Swansea. She studied at the Chicago Musical College before marrying William Bullock in 1899. They had two children. After his death in 1909 she read law at the University of Southern California from 1910-14. 'Georgia' Bullock was the first woman judge in California; none of her judgments was

⁴ Marriage certificate

⁵ Birth certificate

⁶ In 1969 Onfel Thomas (see ref 13) gave Walter Ford (see later) a copy of the Gilsant Pedigree showing how the Philippses of Cwmgwili & Ystradwallt are descended from Cadifor Fawr.

⁷ Death certificate

⁸ Death certificate

⁹ 1901 Census

reversed on appeal.¹⁰ She was the judge for the Ingrid Bergman divorce and the Susan Hayward custody hearing.

The *Cambrian* of 11 July 1851 noted an auction of furniture belonging to the late Reverend Richard Morgan, plus his milch cow and store pig.¹¹ In 1856, when granted administration to dispose of Richard's estate, Georgiana lived at Dynevor Cottage in Cowbridge.¹² For the 1861 census she was at High Street, Cowbridge, with Louis (now aged 19, 'no occupation'), Thomas (aged 12) and Catherine (aged 10), both described as 'scholars', and a young servant, Sarah Whitney; Georgiana was described as a 'landed proprietor'.

According to Onfel Thomas,¹³ Frances began her education in Cowbridge and then moved to a school at Windsor, run by a family friend, before studying in Paris from 1858 to 1861; she was then thought to have continued her studies in Dusseldorf.

In 1865 Elizabeth Garrett (1836–1917) was the first woman to qualify in medicine in Britain when she became a licentiate of the Society of Apothecaries (LSA). Within months she decided to start a small medical school for women. On 9 January 1866 she wrote to her mother: 'we are framing a scheme ... to take a house close by ... and to turn the ground floor into a dispensary for women & children ... - the three pupils wd. of course share the benefits of what practice there was and it might become the nucleus of a hospital with beds. The upper rooms could be used as a school, one room for dissections, another for lectures, others for private study, library etc etc. We propose getting men who are already teaching the several subjects in men's schools to teach the pupils here, ...'¹⁴

The school's other prospective students were Sarah Goff & Ellen Phillips. All three 'pupils' passed the Arts Examination of the Society of Apothecaries on 25 Jan 1867, Frances with honours.¹⁵ In response the Society's Court of

¹⁰ LM. Lam, *Georgia Bullock: Mother of the Los Angeles Women's Court*. Available at <http://www.stanford.edu/library/wlhbhp/papers0203/bullock.lam.pdf>.

¹¹ *The Cambrian*, 11 July 1851. Cambrian Indexing Project, Library & Information Service.

¹² Letter of administration, Consistory Court, Diocese of Llandaff. National Library of Wales: LL/1856/1 B.

¹³ O. Thomas, *Frances Elizabeth Hoggan, 1843–1927*. Privately printed, 1970 (20 pp.). British Library. Onfel Thomas, MBE FSA (1911–1979), was headmaster of the County Primary School, Builth Wells. He was also Secretary of the Brecknock Society for over 25 years, and a distinguished local historian. Sadly the material for his short and much-quoted biography of Frances Hoggan seems to have been lost or destroyed.

¹⁴ Anderson family papers – quoted with permission.

¹⁵ D. Cook 'The quest to qualify: pioneer women doctors and the Society of Apothecaries'. The 1998 Gideon De Laune Lecture, Worshipful Society of Apothecaries; unpublished. Jo Manton's statement in *Elizabeth Garrett Anderson* (London: Methuen, 1965) that Frances's co-examinees were Louisa Atkins and Eliza Walker Dunbar, although widely quoted, is incorrect.

¹⁶ *Ibid.*

Examiners, which had tried to block Garrett's qualification, resolved on 14 February to refuse 'certificates of lectures, or of anatomical instructions, delivered in private to particular students apart from the ordinary classes of recognised, public, medical schools'.¹⁶ This prevented women qualifying because no recognized public medical school would accept them. One possibility remained. In 1865 the Royal College of Surgeons approved the Royal Free Hospital as a suitable place of study for candidates for its membership examination (MRCS). In March 1867 Nathaniel Heckford (1842–1871) a young doctor at the London Hospital, where he had taught Elizabeth Garrett, asked the Royal Free if it would receive ladies as pupils; this initiative was not followed up.¹⁷ The plans for Garrett's little school were abandoned.

Sarah Goff was a rich Irish heiress. She married Heckford on 28 January 1867, three days after taking the Apothecaries examination. They founded the East London Hospital for Children in Hackney which opened on their first wedding anniversary. Nathaniel died of tuberculosis on 14 December 1871. Sarah and Frances remained good friends. Frances was a trustee of a fund set up by Sarah at Coutts Bank in July 1874. Sarah moved to South Africa in 1878, returning to England in 1901; when she died in 1903 she and Frances were still close friends.¹⁸

Ellen Phillips was from a wealthy Quaker family. After quitting her studies, she and her sister Mary set up a small dispensary for women and children at 13 Virginia Row, Bethnal Green. It opened on 12 July 1867. In 1868 it moved to Hackney Road as the North Eastern Hospital for Children and in 1908 became the Queen's Hospital for Children; in 1942 this combined with the East London Hospital to form the Queen Elizabeth Hospital for Children, which became one of the world's leading paediatric hospitals. Ellen married Alexander Fox, another young London Hospital doctor. They emigrated to New Zealand. After his death in 1876 Ellen returned to Britain, converted to Roman Catholicism and died 3 January 1890.¹⁹

Frances Morgan, unlike Sarah and Ellen, continued her studies. She moved to Zurich, where, with Louisa Atkins, she matriculated in the autumn of 1867. Her character and intelligence impressed everyone and she became a legend in

¹⁷ Minutes of Royal Free Hospital Weekly Board, 14 March 1867. Royal Free Archives.

¹⁸ V. Allen *Lady Trader: A Biography of Mrs Sarah Heckford*. London: Collins, 1979.

¹⁹ V.A.J. Swain. Early history to 1914. In: J. Kosky, ed. *The Queen Elizabeth Hospital for Children: 125 Years of Achievement*. London: Hospitals for Sick Children, 1992, 1–28. According to the *Dictionary of Quaker Biography*, an unpublished typescript at Friends' House, Euston Road, London NW1 2BJ, Ellen resigned from the Society of Friends in 1878, having joined the Church of England.

Zurich.²⁰ Male colleagues treated her as an equal within months. A hard worker, she completed the medical course in three years, and also took a course in Sanskrit. She graduated on 12 March 1870 – the second woman to get an MD in Europe. The first, Nadjesda Suslova from St. Petersburg, graduated MD Zurich three years earlier.

Frances's thesis on muscular dystrophy was highly commended. Her public defence of it aroused great interest as women medical students were a novelty and there were reports of a disagreement with her thesis director, Anton Biermer. More than 400 turned up and the audience was moved to the Aula, the university's largest hall; it was the only time it was used for this purpose.²¹ Biermer was highly complimentary about her work.

According to Onfel Thomas she studied in Vienna, Prague and Paris before returning to Britain. Her foreign degree did not allow her to be included in the Medical Register. Elizabeth Garrett employed her as a physician at the St Mary's Dispensary for Women and Children in Seymour Street. In 1875 it moved to Marylebone Road as the New Hospital for Women, which subsequently moved to the Euston Road. The name was changed to the 'Elizabeth Garrett Anderson Hospital' in 1917.

Frances, who covered for Garrett's patients when Garrett married on 9 February 1871,²² began work at the dispensary in March 1871. That year she, along with Elizabeth Blackwell, Barbara Bodichon, Ernest Hart and others, founded the National Health Society; Frances was its first Honorary Secretary. The National Health Society created the motto 'Prevention is Better than Cure'.²³ It aimed: *to assist in the formation of local societies, to induce schools to include sanitary instruction in their teachings, to form an office for answering questions, from private individuals and others, as to the proper modes of procedure in cases of sanitary difficulty, and to establish a reference library, with plans, models, and papers.*

We do not know how Frances met George Hoggan, whom she married on 1 April 1874 at Marylebone Register Office – an unusual venue for the daughter of an Anglican priest.²⁴ The witnesses were Rose Anna Shedlock and William Bowman Macleod (1843–1899). Macleod, a dentist, was the first Dean of the Edinburgh Dental Hospital and School, President of the British Dental

²⁰ T. N. Bonner, *To the Ends of the Earth: Women's Search for Education in Medicine*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1992.

²¹ *Ibid.*

²² Letter from Alexander Anderson to his wife (9 February 1871): Anderson family papers.

²³ N. A. Sahli, 'Elizabeth Blackwell, MD (1821–1910)', PhD thesis, University of Pennsylvania, 1974: 206.

²⁴ Marriage certificate.

Association at its Edinburgh meeting in 1895, and author of a paper on 'The effects of bagpipe playing on the teeth'.²⁵

George Hoggan was born in Edinburgh in 1837. His father, also George, was described in his son's marriage certificate as a 'Painter (Decorative)', from Kinross; his mother Margaret, née Bell, was apparently from the family of Robert Burns. George Jr. left school aged 12. After serving an apprenticeship he joined the Indian navy as an engineer and served through the Indian Mutiny (1857), the China war (1860) and the Abyssinian campaign (1868). When David Livingstone visited India early in 1866 he asked whether Hoggan could accompany him on his (final and fatal) African expedition; permission was refused.²⁶

Hoggan moved on to study medicine in Edinburgh. He graduated MB, CM in 1872, having published his first, and quite fascinating, scientific paper, 'A new mechanical theory of respiration', in the *Transactions of the Royal Medical Society* in 1870. An expanded version, 'On the erectile action of the blood-pressure in inspiration, and its important agency in the various functions of life', appeared in the *Edinburgh Medical Journal* in October 1872.²⁷

While a student, Hoggan was an anatomy demonstrator with the surgeon Peter Handyside (1808-1881), the only extramural teacher of anatomy recognized by the University of Edinburgh. When Handyside began teaching Sophia Jex-Blake (1840-1912) and her colleagues in October 1870, Hoggan gave the women their first practical anatomy class. He also organized and led the escort (mainly of Irish veterinary students) that protected them from harassment at the time of the infamous 'Riot at Surgeons' Hall' in November 1870.²⁸

Hoggan spent four months in Paris with Claude Bernard (1813-1878), probably in 1873,²⁹ and was shocked by the animal experiments, which he described in the *Morning Post* of 1 February 1875 in expressing his own opposition to vivisection. He joined forces with Frances Power Cobbe to found the Society for Protection of Animals Liable to Vivisection (better known as

²⁵ L. Lindsay, 'Personalities of the past. XXVII: William Bowman Macleod' *British Dental Journal* 1955, 94: 207. The paper on bagpipe playing and the teeth was published in the *Cameron Highlander*.

²⁶ Obituary, George Hoggan, *British Medical Journal* 1891; i:1411.

²⁷ *Transactions of the Royal Medical Society* 1870;140: *Edinburgh Medical Journal*, 1872;18: 338-46.

²⁸ F. Hoggan, 'Women in medicine (Europe)' In: T. Stanton, ed. *The Women Question in Europe*. London: Sampson Low, 1884. George wrote a section of Frances's chapter. See also M. Todd *Life of Sophia Jex-Blake*. London: Macmillan, 1918: 292, 346.

²⁹ In *The Zoophilist*, 1 April 1893, 311, Frances stated that George's views were 'founded on experience acquired twenty years ago'.

the 'Victoria Street Society'). The Hoggans hosted its first meeting, on 2 December 1875.³⁰ George was Honorary Secretary until 1878, when he left amicably because the Society adopted a policy of *total* abolition of vivisection. Frances, a member of the first executive committee, became Cobbe's doctor and close friend.³¹

After the wedding George, who had lived at 12 Upper Montague Street, moved in with Frances at 13 Granville Place (Portman Square). For the 1881 census the Hoggans lived at 7 Trevor Terrace, Rutland Gate (just off Kensington Road), with a cook and housemaid. Also recorded is one Elsie Morgan – an unmarried 'Student of Arts', aged 19, born in Brussels as a British subject and listed as George's 'sister-in-law'.³² According to E. Adair Impey, Frances and George held the same consulting hours in separate consulting rooms at home.³³

Frances dealt mainly with women and children. George joined the staff of St John's Hospital for Diseases of the Skin in 1877, but resigned in 1879³⁴ after accusing its Secretary and Board of Management of mismanagement and misappropriation of funds in a letter to the *Medical Press and Circular* of 12 November 1879. An action for criminal libel, brought against George and the publisher of the *Medical Press*, ended in a compromise. George was found not guilty and his legal advisers withdrew all imputations against the management of the hospital.³⁵

The London School of Medicine for Women opened in October 1874. In January 1875 Frances's name was included in a list of those to be asked to join the school's Governing Body; she seems to have turned down the invitation and was never a member.³⁶ Midwifery was taught at LSMW from the summer of 1876 and William Smoult Playfair (1835–1903) was the original choice to give the lectures. For some reason Garrett Anderson took his place but she switched to teach Practice of Medicine with King Chambers. At LSMW's

³⁰ *Animal's Defender and Zoophilist*, January 1926, 73

³¹ F.P. Cobbe, *Life of Frances Power Cobbe, as told by herself*. London: Swan Sonnenschein, 1904: 468.

³² 1881 census.

³³ Archives and Manuscripts, Wellcome Library SA/MWF/C 3)

³⁴ B. Russell, ed. *St John's Hospital for Diseases of the Skin, 1863–1963*. Edinburgh: E. & S. Livingstone Ltd, 1963. The hospital was then at 45 Leicester Square. Onfel Thomas claimed Frances visited the Near East in 1884 and gave help and advice to those running the leper centres. Given her husband's dermatological interest it seems more likely he gave the advice.

³⁵ *Medical Press and Circular*, 12 November 1879, 14 January, 1 March, 31 March, 28 April, 5 May, 26 May and 9 June 1880, and 4 May 1881. *The Times*, 29 May, 8 June and 4 November 1880.

³⁶ Minutes of Provisional Council, LSMW, 13 January 1875. Royal Free Hospital Archives. Neither did she join the Association of Registered Medical Women, later the Medical Women's Federation, because it was restricted to women on the Medical Register.

Council on 23 July 1875 she proposed Frances as her replacement. Others moved an amendment 'that no unregistered practitioner be appointed to lecture on any branch of medical practice'. This was lost, but the vote on the original motion was evenly split. The chairman, Stansfeld, gave his casting vote against Frances. Five days later, Ford Anderson and Elizabeth Blackwell were elected co-lecturers on midwifery.³⁷

Frances, who assisted Garrett Anderson at surgical operations at the New Hospital, became concerned about her employer's surgical competence and suggested that Meredith, an experienced male gynaecologist who helped in difficult cases, should undertake all abdominal surgery. Frances resigned from the New Hospital in April 1877.³⁸ Garrett Anderson's surgery remained an issue. Meredith eventually resigned in February 1888;³⁹ Louisa Atkins and Mary Dowson resigned over the same issue in April 1888.⁴⁰

In 1875 Frances, although still unregistered, was the second woman elected to the British Medical Association (BMA) following Garrett Anderson's election in 1873. Both presented papers at the Edinburgh meeting in 1875; Frances spoke on 'A new histological process for staining tissues'.⁴¹ During this meeting BMA members, unhappy about female membership, called for a referendum on the matter. In a postal vote in November 1875, three-quarters opposed the admission of women. However, no action resulted until a special general meeting, on 8 August 1878, at which members voted 'That no female be eligible as a member of the Association'. Frances's membership was declared invalid because she had not been on the Medical Register when elected, although she was when her membership was rescinded; Garrett Anderson was not expelled.⁴²

Following her graduation in Zurich Frances was unable to enter the Medical Register because foreign degrees were not accepted; British examining boards would not examine women, some because their rules forbade it. On 11 August 1876, an Act was passed that enabled all medical examining boards to examine women if they so wished. The King's and Queen's College of Physicians of Ireland was the first to do so. The first three women to obtain its licentiatehip (LKQCPI), and so enter the Medical Register, were Zurich graduates: Eliza

³⁷ *Ibid.*, 28 July 1875. Ford Anderson was Garrett Anderson's brother-in-law.

³⁸ Minutes of the Managing Committee of New Hospital for Women, 28 April 1877. London Metropolitan Archives: H13/EGA/019.

³⁹ *Ibid.*: 1 February, 6 June 1888. William Appleton Meredith (1848–1916) resigned in February but did not give his reason for doing so until June.

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*: 22 February 1888, 11 April 1888.

⁴¹ P. Bartrip, *Themselves Writ Large. The British Medical Association 1832–1966*. London: BMA Publishing, 1996: 49.

⁴² *Ibid.*, 49. Report of annual meeting of BMA. *British Medical Journal*, 17 August 1878, 253–6.

Walker Dunbar (admitted January 1877) and Frances Hoggan and Louisa Atkins (in February 1877). In 1880 Frances became the first female member (MKQCPI) of that College (later renamed the Royal College of Physicians of Ireland).

Frances was the first woman to do high quality medical research and co-authored many papers with George; most dealt with the fine anatomy of the lymphatics (of a variety of organs) and with peripheral nerves and their terminations; illustrations were made using the camera lucida.⁴³ Not surprisingly, given their involvement in the antivivisection movement, none of their studies were done on live animals.

Frances published at least 14 papers in her own name, several on topics linked to the aims of the National Health Society; for example 'The Position of the Mother in the Family' and 'Physical Education for Girls'.⁴⁴ The latter contained recommendations on healthy clothes and shoes and a condemnation of 'tight-lacing'. In 'Sanitary Conveniences for Women', published in the *Sanitary Record* of 15 December 1880, she commented on 'the sufferings, both physical and mental, which women endure for want of water-closet accommodation when away from their own homes'. In 1882 Frances replaced Emily Bovell-Sturge as School Doctor at North London Collegiate School and served until October 1885. She dealt with general health problems, and with fitness to undertake gymnasium training.

Frances Hoggan's article 'Medical Women For India' appeared in *The Contemporary Review* in 1882.⁴⁵ George Kittredge, an American businessman in Bombay, read the article and set up the Medical Women for India Fund, Bombay, to recruit women doctors for India, while Mr Pestonjee Cama offered to build a women's hospital to be staffed by women doctors. Kittredge met Edith Pechey in Paris in 1883 and persuaded her to become senior medical officer of the proposed Cama Hospital.

George fell ill during or before 1884. He and Frances gave up their practices and moved to the south of France. According to his obituary in the *British Medical Journal* they left London in 1885, although in the *Medical Directory* for 1886 their address was still given as 7 Trevor Terrace. In the *Directory* for 1887 it was 'Monaco, Italy', while from 1888 to 1891 it was 'Villa Griselli, Beaulieu, Alpes Maritime, France'. George died at Nice on 18 May 1891; the

⁴³ The camera lucida was an instrument that facilitated the accurate sketching of an object. Its prism or mirrors caused the eye to perceive a reflected image as if it lay on the paper on which it was to be traced. A version for use with a microscope was introduced in about 1880.

⁴⁴ F. Hoggan, *The Position of the Mother in the Family in its Legal and Scientific Aspects* Manchester: A Ireland & Co., 1884. F. Hoggan *Physical Education for Girls*. London: Swan, Sonnenschein & Allen, 1880 (a lecture given to the Fröbel Society, 9 December 1879).

⁴⁵ F. Hoggan, 'Medical Women For India', *Contemporary Review*, August 1882, 267-275.

cause of death was 'a cerebral tumour which had led to deposits in various other parts'. He was cremated at Père Lachaise cemetery in Paris; his ashes were buried at St John's Crematorium in Woking.⁴⁶

According to Onfel Thomas, Frances did not resume practice on her return to England. Instead '... she threw herself with even greater zeal into those social problems in which she had long been interested'.⁴⁷ However, he did not provide supporting evidence, and drew attention only to her concern about the plight of coloured people in the United States, 'which again she had seen for herself on more than one visit'. Certainly she spoke on the matter in Britain and the USA, and wrote on slavery and the abuse of black people, on her admiration of black American women, and on the contributions of black American soldiers.⁴⁸ According to her obituary in the *British Medical Journal* her interest in the colour question extended more widely; when over 68 years old she joined an expedition to inspect native villages in South Africa.⁴⁹ Thomas also stated that in 1914, at the outbreak of war, Frances offered to run a hospital for the British government but because of her age (70 years) her offer was not accepted.⁵⁰

Some indication of Frances's whereabouts between 1892 and 1927 can be obtained by checking the addresses given for her each year in the *Medical Directory*. That for 1892 was her mother's address in Pembrokeshire ('Heatherland', Begelly); the following year she may have been in London but from 1894 to 1897 she was "Travelling". She then seems to have lived at Eastcombe, Stroud, Gloucestershire, for four years. Most of the following seventeen years were spent in north London – initially in East Finchley (26 Durham Road) and then in Highgate (15 Bisham Gardens) and Finchley ('Hillview', 104 Squire's Lane). However in 1911 she was travelling again and her address was 'c/o a Miss Webster' in Kensington.⁵¹ Her *Directory* address for 1920 was the Ladies' University Club, 4 George Street, Hanover Square,

⁴⁶ Obituary, George Hoggan (see note 26).

⁴⁷ O. Thomas (see note 13). The *Medical Directory* does not indicate 'retired' until 1911, when Frances Hoggan was 67, although 'retired' was added to the entry for some other doctors before that year.

⁴⁸ F. Hoggan, 'American negro women during their first fifty years of freedom', *The Individualist*, October 1913 (reprinted by the Personal Rights Association). This article mentions an address she gave at North Craftsbury, Vermont, in 1912. She spoke on inter-racial problems at the First Universal Race Congress in London in 1911. Her article 'The American negro and race-blending' appeared in the *Social Review* in 1909. Onfel Thomas also quotes another of her articles, 'The Negro Soldier and others'.

⁴⁹ Obituaries, Frances Hoggan. *British Medical Journal* 1927;ii: 357; *Lancet* 1927;i: 412.

⁵⁰ O. Thomas (see note 13).

⁵¹ The record (www.Ellisland.org) shows she arrived in New York on 30 November 1911 on SS *St Louis* from Southampton. On 15 May 1912 she and Elizabeth Lockie were 'visiting the Chamberlains at Auld Lang Syne', and in the first week of June she 'gave a lecture on Africa for the benefit of the juniors'.

London W1; from 1921 to 1923 it was 22 Harrington Road, South Kensington; and from 1924 until her death it was again her club, which had moved to Audley Square and changed its name to the Women's University Club.⁵² Presumably she stayed there while in London and used the address for official correspondence (including her will). However, for her last five years she lived in Brighton.

Frances died at 13 Clarence Square in Brighton on 5 February 1927, aged 83. The Medical Register for 1924 placed her at 17A Belgrave Road, Kemp Town, Brighton; that for 1925 gave her address as 28 Eaton Place, Brighton. However, her death certificate gives her last home as 152 Marine Parade, Brighton. A post-mortem examination was not carried out. Gerald W. Beresford, FRCS, certified that she died of old age and heart failure. The informant was Miss B.M.E. Stratton, a "cousin", of 90 Belgrave Road, London SW.⁵³ The *British Medical Journal* and *Lancet* obituaries claimed that until her final three months she was active in body and mind and interested in professional matters.⁵⁴

Frances was cremated in Woking, where her ashes were buried with those of her husband. About 40 years ago the site was marked, according to Onfel Thomas,⁵⁵ by a small wooden cross, inscribed "Plot 21", although the Hoggans plot was actually 22A. Now nothing marks the spot. On 14 March 1970, 100 years after Frances graduated in Zurich, the Brecknock Society met in Brecon Cathedral and presented the brass font ewer in her memory.

'Elsie'

Frances Hoggan led a fascinating life. She was arguably the most gifted of the early medical women, but her professional life seems to have been curtailed by her husband's illness and early death. However, an event early in her life might have dashed all hopes of a career in medicine.

The 1881 census return described Elsie Morgan, the student of arts present at 7 Trevor Terrace on census day, as George's 'sister-in-law'. 'Elsie' was then nineteen; as Frances's father died 30 years earlier he could not have been Elsie's father. She was born in Brussels, but there is no record that an Elsie Morgan was born there in 1861 or 1862. As she was an arts student in a medical household it seemed possible she was studying for the preliminary examination in arts that medical students had to pass before sitting their

⁵² The records of the club show she was elected a member in July 1909.

⁵³ Death certificate.

⁵⁴ Obituaries, Frances Hoggan (see note 49).

⁵⁵ O. Thomas (see note 13).

professional examinations. The London School of Medicine for Women was the only medical school then open to women. An 'Elise' Morgan enrolled there in the winter term of 1880 to study chemistry;⁵⁶ it was an optional subject for the Apothecaries' preliminary examination in arts, which she took in January 1881 and obtained a second-class pass.⁵⁷ There is no record that she continued with medical studies.

An Elise Morgan was born in Brussels. Her birth certificate states she was the daughter of John Morgan, born Cowbridge (England)⁵⁸ and Georgiana Philipps, born Carmarthen (England) who were living together in London. She was born at 11 a.m. on 26 October 1861 at Rue Saint Jean S.8 N.12. The declaration was made by Théophile Manotiau, obstetrician, aged 32 years, living at Rue de la Violette S.8 N.43 - in the presence of Laurent Sanders, ladies' tailor, aged 43 years, and Jean Baptiste Porte, painter, aged 49 years, both domiciled in Brussels.⁵⁹ However, the International Genealogical Index of the Church of Latter Day Saints gives her parents as Richard Morgan and Georgiana Catherina Philipps, and also identifies them as Frances's parents.

It is difficult to escape the conclusion that Frances was the mother of Elise. Georgiana, Frances's mother, is the only other candidate. Aged only 41, she could have borne another child. However, as she was at High Street, Cowbridge, with three of her children on census day 1861 (7 April), when she would have been pregnant with Elise, it seems unlikely she was cohabiting with the putative father in London. Furthermore, as she was to bring the child up as her own daughter, Elise Morgan, thus explaining Elise's designation as George's sister-in-law, one might have expected her to use her married name, Morgan, rather than her maiden name, Philipps, for the birth certificate.

Frances was 17 when Elise was born. According to Onfel Thomas she had been studying in Paris. It seems more likely she would have travelled from Paris to Brussels to give birth than that her mother would have journeyed from South Wales for the same purpose. While a John Morgan, born in Cowbridge, could conceivably have been Elise's father, the surname Morgan was probably chosen to help hide an illegitimate child within the family.

On census day 1861 Frances and her sister Emma were at Burnt Farm, Cheshunt, Herts staying with her uncle Thomas Morgan (Richard's brother) and his wife Harriet, presumably for the Easter holidays.⁶⁰ A number of other young people were also there, including John George Waters (Harriet's son by a previous marriage), a student at St George's Hospital, aged 22. He qualified

⁵⁶ Admission records, LSMW. Royal Free Hospital Archives.

⁵⁷ Personal communication, Dee Cook, Archivist, Worshipful Society of Apothecaries.

⁵⁸ At that time Wales was not recognized in official records.

⁵⁹ Brussels birth certificate.

⁶⁰ Easter Sunday was on 31 March.

MRCSEng 1864 and became a ship's surgeon with the Inman Line. If Elise was not born prematurely Frances would have been about two months pregnant while at the farm.

Although Elise was to be raised as Georgiana's daughter there is evidence that Frances did not simply abandon her to Georgiana's care. When Elizabeth Garrett was planning to open a small medical school for women she wrote as follows to her father on 10 January 1866: '... I have had a visit this morning from another lady who wants to study medicine. She is also promising and wishes to apprentice herself at once to me. Being a governess she is not very rich but she thinks she has saved enough money for the education and that she could afford to wait the usual time for practice. She has been a great deal abroad and has passed the Paris examn. for general education. She must go back to Paris to settle some business there and *help her mother*⁶¹ to pack up the household as she means to live here while she is studying. ...This Miss Morgan wants to settle the apprenticeship business before she goes back to Paris on Monday. I explained our scheme to her and she is quite ready to join it.'⁶² Elise would have been four years old at the time.

On the day of the 1871 census soon after Frances, now MD Zurich, started working with Garrett Anderson at the Seymour Street Dispensary, she was living at 36 Upper Grosvenor Street with her mother 'Georgina' (aged 50 years), her *niece*⁶¹ 'Elize' (now aged 9 years); and Susannah Harriett Battersby, a servant (aged 20 years). This again suggests that Frances played an important role in Elise's upbringing.

Elise Morgan and John Evans

Elise married John Evans, born in Tregaron in 1857, at the parish church of St Martin's, Salisbury, in Wiltshire, on 29 September 1887.⁶³ The witnesses were Georgiana C. Morgan and Frances Elizabeth Hoggan. Before the wedding Elise lived in Exeter Street; John was a clerk in holy orders at Clydach in Glamorgan. His career moves can be traced in the annual issues of *Crockford's Clerical Directory*. A non-college student at Oxford,⁶⁴ he graduated BA in 1886 with first-class honours from the Theology School. He proceeded MA in 1891 and BD and DD in 1906. From 1888 he was a curate in Staffordshire – first at Fenton (where their first child, Ivor, was born, on 20 October 1890) and then at Coseley. Alice Dorothy, their second child, was

⁶¹ My emphasis.

⁶² Garrett Anderson papers.

⁶³ Marriage certificate.

⁶⁴ *Oxford Historical Register 1220–1900*, 575. The status of 'non-college' student came about after 1868. Such students kept statutable residence in houses or licensed lodgings within the limit of a circle, centred on Carfax and with a radius of one and a half miles.

born at West Bromwich (near Coseley) on 12 December 1891. From 1896 to 1899 John was vicar of Barholme with Stowe in Lincolnshire. Subsequently *Crockford's* lists him simply as a 'licensed preacher' in the dioceses of Lincoln, Ely and Peterborough from 1900, and of Southwell (Nottinghamshire) from 1906.

For the 1901 census and in *Crockford's* for 1904 the family lived at 'Mayfield', London Road, Fletton, Peterborough; two sons were there on census day: John Grismond (aged four) and George Herbert (aged two), both born at Barholme. Alexandra Catherina, their fifth and youngest child, was born in Peterborough on 7 November 1901. *Crockford's* for 1905 and 1906 places them at 356 Humberstone Road, Leicester. From 1907 they lived at Gobion House, Mowsley, in Leicestershire.

The information about Elise's parents in the International Genealogical Index was clearly wrong, although relevant. The informant was Walter Philipps Ford, the Canadian grandson of John and Elise.⁶⁵ The family left Mowsley for Canada in 1911 and settled on a ranch in Ardenode, Alberta. John died there on 16 August 1920. Problems arose over ownership of the ranch owing to poor paperwork when it was acquired, and Elise moved with John Grismond, her third child, to Victoria in Colwood at the southern end of Vancouver Island. There she died on 5 August 1951. Her eldest child, Ivor, had stayed in Britain and graduated BA at Oxford in 1915. An Anglican priest, he died on 20 June 1984 (aged 93). Of Elise's five children only one, Alexandra Catherina (Rina), had offspring – a son (Walter) and a daughter.

Walter Ford told me he and his Uncle Ivor had concluded from their own research in the 1960s and 1970s that Elise was Frances's daughter. They realized Richard Morgan could not have been Elise's father, and noted that the Brussels birth certificate gave Georgina Philipps, not Georgiana Morgan as the mother. In his own notes Walter Ford wrote of Frances:

Although sealed in the Temple as my Great Aunt she was in actuality by blood line my great-grandmother – being the mother of Elise Morgan (Evans).

Of Elise he noted:

She was raised as the younger sister of AUNT FANNY (Frances Elizabeth Hoggan). Family research disclosed that her (Elise's) so-called father died 10 yrs before she was born [in Brussels]. All other family members were born in South Wales. I am grateful that my grandmother was not aborted (as in today's world) otherwise I might never have existed, or if so, not under such noble ancestry or circumstances.⁶⁶

⁶⁵ Walter Ford, with whom the author corresponded by telephone, e-mail and letter, supplied many family documents and photographs. Sadly he died in December 2005.

⁶⁶ From notes on his family provided by Walter Ford, with permission.

Walter Ford told me that although Elise was raised as the sister of Frances, Emma and Catherine, her background always seemed shrouded in mystery. He believed Elise was unaware of the circumstances of her birth. When knowingly he provided the erroneous information on her parentage to the Church of Latter Day Saints he did so, understandably, to sustain the family version of Elise's legitimacy.

Frances's legacy

Frances wrote her will on 25 May 1926.⁶⁷ From an estate of just under £3000 she left £1100 to Margaret von Seydewitz;⁶⁸ £200 to her sister, Emma Jane Jones; and £100 each to her executors and trustees – the Reverend Ivor Evans (Elise's son) and Beatrice Stratton (a cousin) – and to Fanny Crump. Frances Hoggan Talbot Pearson⁶⁹ and Dr W B Du Bois⁷⁰ each received £50; she left £20 to the Coloured Women's Club of Los Angeles and the remainder to 'my said sister' (presumably Emma). If Frances wanted Elise to remain unaware of their true relationship, it is hardly surprising she was left nothing in the will.

Frances Hoggan (née Morgan) deserves a place in the story of women's struggle to join the medical profession. She was the first British woman to obtain an MD in Europe; the first female member of a British College of Physicians; the first to join Garrett Anderson at the dispensary that became the New Hospital for Women; and the first British woman to do high-quality medical research. She was the bride in Britain's first medical marriage, a key figure in the anti-vivisection movement and in the fight to improve women's education in Wales, and an outspoken critic of the treatment of black people in the USA.

In today's more tolerant times it is sobering to reflect that none of this would have been achieved had it been suspected, before she began medical studies, that Frances had had an illegitimate child and, even if suspicion had arisen

⁶⁷ Probate was granted at Lewes on 12 April 1927

⁶⁸ This person has not been identified. A Margaret von Seydewitz translated Rudolf Eucken's *Ethics and Modern Thought – A Theory of Their Relations* (New York: G P Putnam & Sons, 1913) from the original German. A Baron von Seidewitz, a friend of the Heckfords, worked as a doctor at their East London Hospital for Children in 1870-1, but as his claim that he had qualified in Paris could not be confirmed he was eventually forced out, largely through the efforts of Garrett Anderson.

⁶⁹ Frances Hoggan Talbot Pearson has also proved elusive.

⁷⁰ Dr W. E. B. Du Bois (1868–1963) was a prominent African-American philosopher and writer. Frances Hoggan refers to him in her article 'American Negro women...' (see note 48). On page 222 of his autobiography 'Dawn of Dusk' he wrote 'By grace of an English friend, Frances Hoggan, I roamed through England, Scotland and a bit of France in 1906 on a bicycle and saw the Island of Skye and Edinburgh, the Lake and Shakespeare countries and London.'

only after her death, one wonders whether a font ewer would have been dedicated to her memory at Brecon Cathedral in 1970.⁷¹

⁷¹ While I was preparing this paper many people helped. I am particularly indebted to the late Walter Philipps Ford, grandson of Elise Evans (née Morgan), who by telephone and correspondence provided information about his grandmother and her family, and also to his son Roger Ford. I am grateful to the staff of the following libraries: the British Library and its newspaper library at Colindale, National Library of Wales, Brecon Library, Wellcome Medical History Library, Royal Society of Medicine Library, and the Library of the Society of Friends. I am also grateful to Marianne Smith, Librarian at the Royal College of Surgeons of Edinburgh, and to the following archivists: Dee Cook, Worshipful Society of Apothecaries; Sheila Morris, Women's University Club; David Chatfield, Brecon Cathedral; Malcolm Johns, Brecon Museum; Hugh Petrie, Hendon Local Studies Archives; Richard Brighton, Cambrian Indexing Project, Swansea; Victoria North, Royal Free Hospital Archives; the staff of the London Metropolitan Archives; the Family Records Office; International Genealogical Index of the Church of Latter Day Saints; Archives de L'État à Anderlecht. I have had great help from local historians including: Tom Davies of Neath; Ken Jones, Chairman of the Brecknock Society; John Lacey of Mowsley. I have also been greatly helped by Sue Gamble, St John's Crematorium, Woking. As always, Elizabeth Crawford has been a fund of knowledge about the women's movement, and I am indebted to Katrina Williams, Jersey, for permission to quote from the Garrett Anderson papers.